

INTERNATIONAL WORKSHOP

*Advances in Ancient Black Sea Studies:
Methodological Innovation, Interdisciplinary
Perspectives and International Cooperation*

*Organized in the context of the research projects:
Bibliographia classica orae septentrionalis Ponti Euxini.
III. Ars, res sacrae & mythologica
and
Ethnic Identities and Diplomatic Affiliations
of the Bosporan Kingdom*

P A P E R A B S T R A C T S

*Organizers:
Victor Cojocaru & Altay Co kun
Conference Secretarial Office:
Lavinia Grumeza, Anca Munteanu & Lucian Munteanu*

*International Workshop at the Romanian Academy, Ia i Branch
(17-18 July 2017)*

**BCOSPE III. Ars, Res Sacrae & Mythologica:
Some Considerations on a New Research Project**

Victor Cojocaru
(Institute of Archaeology Iași)

Ars, Res Sacrae & Mythologica is the third of a planned series of five volumes dedicated to the bibliography of the northern Black Sea shore in antiquity. An up-to-date bibliographic guide to studies in the ancient history of the Northern Black Sea has long been a desideratum, both for Western and Eastern scholars. The events occurring in the Black Sea countries since 1990 made possible an increasing cooperation towards overcoming the divides between Classical scholarship in the western and eastern hemispheres. Besides the participation in numerous international conferences organized on the both sides of the former 'Iron Curtain', research results were exchanged to a growing extent, and Eastern European research results are now ever more frequently published in Western journals and book series. Nevertheless, scholarly positions on the Northern Black Sea coast often continue to be divided along the old geopolitical lines. Looking for a way out of this *aporia*, the author of this paper began to compile and gradually digest a bibliography as complete as possible of the Northern Black Sea coast in Antiquity. The conception of such a *Bibliographia classica orae septentrionalis Ponti Euxini* (BCOSPE) was only possible thanks to his intensive cooperation with both Eastern and Western European colleagues. The publication of the first volume (*Epigraphica, Numismatica, Onomastica & Prosopographica*, 2014) was welcomed as the first instalment of a new standard tool for everyone working on the Ancient Black Sea Region. While work on volume II (*Archaeologica*, ca. 2018) is progressing, preparations for volume III are already underway. The present paper will introduce into its overall structure, geographical and chronological scope and try to give a preliminary description of the *status quaestionis* and proposed objectives. Also addressed will be some innovative elements, before some methodological difficulties will be discussed.

Religion around the Black Sea: A Survey of Recent Literature

Ligia Ruscu
(Babeş-Bolyai University of Cluj)

My presentation will be concerned with the most recent research on religions and cults in Greek cities around the Black Sea. I shall attempt to summarize the most relevant publications of the last 10-15 years, synthesis works as well as discussions of individual cases and instances, on topics such as: permanence and change in the religious life of these cities, the emergence, acceptance and diffusion of new cults, the reciprocal influences between Greek cities and indigenous/extraneous populations, the structure of religious and cultic institutions, the reflection of cults in art and artefacts, the impact of the coming of Rome in the Black Sea area. I shall examine the most characteristic trends in recent literature, the various ways chosen by researchers to gain new insights into the topic, and shall exemplify some aspects of the evolution of religious life in this area, as pursued in research, such as agency, substitution, imitation or contest.

**From the North Pontic Traditions to the Roman Imports and Baltic Amber:
Sarmatian *Barbaricum* as Endless Contact Zone of Antiquity**

Lavinia Grumeza
(Institute of Archaeology Iași)

The part of Europe addressed by the current project – the South Hungarian Plain/the *Sarmatian Barbaricum* – represents an important contact zone of Antiquity, characterized by a variety of influences, migrations and long-distance contacts. This project is designed to serve as the most complete and accessible work for the Roman, North-Pontic and amber artefacts attested in this part of the ancient world. The research methodology will be strictly adapted to the objectives of the project: setting up a database with all these products, elaborating a *corpus* of the Roman imports, carrying out archaeometric analyses (in order to precisely establish the origin of the artefacts), determining the routes by which these products arrived in the *Barbaricum*, and disseminating the results.

This project is also supposed to serve as a stepping stone and encouragement for constructive dialogues between scholars of various disciplines and nationalities, in order to overcome fragmentation of research in Europe. It will thus contribute to increase the visibility at an international level of the peripherals and neglected regions of the European *Barbaricum* (regions from Romania, Serbia and Hungary), and stimulate several further multidisciplinary studies.

Panorama de l'amphorologie grecque
dans les pays autour de la mer Noire depuis 2010

Thibaut Castelli

(Université Paris Ouest Nanterre La Défense)

L'étude des amphores grecques autour de la mer Noire n'est pas séparable de celle concernant le reste du monde grec. Après une période marquée par des progrès importants des chronologies amphoriques à la fin des années 1990 et au début des années 2000, ces dernières années ont vu un effort de publications des collections de musée particulièrement à Kertch et à Anapa. Du matériel de fouilles récentes provenant de Tyras en Ukraine et de Kostadin Tchechma en Bulgarie a également été mis à disposition de la communauté scientifique. Ces nouveaux éléments vont permettre d'avancer sur la question des timbres englyphiques, que ce soit sur leur chronologie ou sur leur attribution à Héraclée qui a été remise en question pour certains d'entre eux. Les trois colloques PATABS ont permis, par de nombreux petits articles, des avancées ponctuelles pour l'étude de centres producteurs secondaires égéens et des centres consommateurs pontiques. L'examen de l'intégralité des fragments amphoriques d'un site et les analyses de la composition chimique des pâtes prennent de plus en plus d'importance dans la réflexion sur ce type de matériel. Des sites de la fin de l'époque hellénistique en Bulgarie et en Russie ont fait l'objet de publications qui vont permettre le développement de la recherche sur les amphores de cette période. Ces différentes publications permettent de mieux comprendre le fonctionnement de l'économie antique en particulier à travers les échanges de vin et d'huile.

Facing the Greeks: Impact of the Greeks among Local Populations in Ancient Colonization

Marta Oller Guzmán

(Autonomous University of Barcelona)

The Greek diaspora along the Mediterranean and Black Sea coasts during the archaic period led the Greeks to face a great variety of populations: according to the sources, some of them were peaceful and friendly; others were clearly reluctant to accept foreigners into their land and even used violence to prevent them from establishing there. However, the Greeks managed to found *apoikiai* in many places and with significantly different local counterparts.

Once established, the new Greek foundation continued to develop relationships with local populations, which could be better or worse depending on the period we focus on. In any case, the relationship between Greek colonists and locals has to be considered fundamental to understand the evolution of a colony. In other words, the Greeks abroad were mostly depending on the goodwill of indigenous peoples even at a second stage of the colonization and, in fact, all throughout the history of each colony.

Nevertheless, the effect of the Greek presence on the local population was also noticeable. The development of a wide range of exchanges very often favoured friendly contacts, but it could also be at the origin of conflicts due to the destabilization of former social, economic, political or even cultural structures and customs. This paper will discuss some sources which voice the uneasiness of locals facing the Greeks. This includes many factors: appropriation of territory, Hellenization of local elites, introduction of new cults, trade practices, (over-) exploitation of natural resources (including human beings), etc.

Although the evidence is quite limited, it is nevertheless worth studying, since it conveys insights into the perspectives of locals when confronted with the new Greek way of life.

The Integration of the “Barbarian” World into the Greek Civilization through West Pontic Coinage: A Multidisciplinary Approach

Gabriel Talmațchi & Lucian Munteanu

(Museum of National History and Archaeology Constanța,

Institute of Archaeology Iași)

The colonies situated on the western Black Sea coast fostered the direct participation in an economic exchange network among the Greek and indigenous peoples. In this process, the use of coinage played an important role, starting in the 6th century BC. The present paper aims to examine the changing stages of this development, with some of their local variations, throughout the pre-Roman period (the 6th -1st centuries BC).

This presentation will report on a collaborative research project aimed at monitoring the complex evolution. The focus was on the numismatic evidence, and thus the connections reflected in the exchange of coinage between the main monetary centres in the western Black Sea area (Histria, Tomis and Callatis) and among the neighbouring “barbarian” populations (Scythians, Getae and Thracians) have come under investigation. Despite this concentration, the overall approach was meant to be holistic in its attempts to integrate all available types of evidence (numismatic, archaeological, narrative, and epigraphic) with a variety of scholarly methods employed (numismatic, statistical, mapping, laboratory investigations).

Christianity and the Transformation of Some Pontic Cities in Late Antiquity

Dan Ruscu

(Babeş-Bolyai University of Cluj)

The rise of Christianity in the Black Sea region meant a series of changes in the life of the cities situated on her shores. Some of them, like the mental process of conversion to Christianity, although quite interesting, cannot be scrutinized today owing to a lack of sources. What we can follow, at least in some aspects, are the changes in the social life of the Pontic cities. The process of 'Christianization' of those cities can be defined in more than one way. Tangible aspects are the emergence of churches, either at the periphery, or in important places of the ancient cities; the 'conquest' of the public space by these and other Christian monuments; the disappearance of such public buildings that had previously been connected to the autonomous status of the city; the expansion of the patronage of the local bishop over civic life. In short, we can observe a transformation of the entire urban structure. This paper tries to draw the main lines of the Christianization for the Romanian shore of the Black Sea from the 4th to the 6th century.

Peripheral Aftermath of the Treaty of Apameia in the Black Sea

Germain Payen

(La Sorbonne, Paris & University of Waterloo, Ontario)

The second century BC began with a major geopolitical shift in the Mediterranean and Hellenistic world, one that has been studied extensively, though with a concentration on one of its aspects: the interconnectivity between the Roman and the Hellenic political spheres. This paper seeks to discuss the aftermath of the settlement of Apameia (188) as regards the Black Sea area. The Roman victory over Antiochos III triggered several new opportunities but also challenges for the powers in Anatolia and adjacent territories. Freed from Seleukid control, many kings and dynasts actively reshaped the geopolitical order over the following decades. Their rivalries involved the control of the Black Sea, the southern shores of which belonged to the Pontic and Bithynian kingdoms, while the control of the Marmara Sea was disputed by the Attalids, Rhodians and Bithynians. These rulers entertained diplomatic relations with some cities of the Black Sea, such as Sinope, Herakleia or Tieion on the southern shore, but also Chersonesos Taurike and Mesembria on the northern and western shores. At the same time, the Bosporan Kingdom as well as several Thracian and Scythian dynasties had their own diplomatic networks and political agendas, although positive evidence for this is lacking. All of these authorities had to respond to the retreat of the Seleukid armies.

The war which opposed the Attalid king and his Bithynian and Cappadocian allies to the Pontic king and his Galatian and Armenian allies (ca. 182-179) was of prime importance in this period. This conflict ended with the victory of the Attalid king Eumenes II, assuring a relative supremacy over Anatolia, and saw the participation of a Sarmatian dynast, as well as the conquest of Sinope and the conclusion of an alliance with Chersonesos Taurike for Pharnakes, the king of Pontos (Polybios 25.2). Among the contextual factors may have been major nomadic movements in the region, but this

theory has been challenged and the archaeological evidence needs further examination. The barbarian peoples called 'Sarmatians' or 'Scythians' in civic decrees which mention attacks against the polis territories may well have been subjects of neighbouring states rather than nomadic tribes acting independently. The conclusion of the Pontic War made it clear that Roman hegemony was still a distant political factor, in spite of secondary diplomatic accomplishments by the representatives of the Senate during the peace negotiations.

All in all, the kings of Pontos, Bithynia and Pergamon pursued different strategies as regards the control of the area. As it stands, Eumenes' efforts targeted Thrace and inland-Anatolia, while his influence on the Black Sea relied on diplomatic relations with cities opposed to Bithynia, particularly Herakleia. The Bithynian king expressed a relative disinterest for the northern Pontos Euxeinos, despite the reconquest of Attalid Tiejion, which he received as a reward for his alliance in the war. Pharnakes had to withdraw from central Anatolia after his defeat, but he could keep Sinope. This led to a new maritime orientation for his kingdom, in which he was not challenged by his rivals. The most important long-term outcome of this new direction was the later conquest of the Black Sea basin by Mithradates VI Eupator of Pontos.

**The Return of the King:
Pharnaces II and the Achaemenid Tradition**

Luis Ballesteros Pastor
(Universidad de Sevilla)

Pharnaces II sought to be seen as a Persian king and probably wore a tiara. He was actually a proud son of Mithridates Eupator, but, at the same time, he aimed to be regarded as a ruler most closely linked to the Achaemenids and the satraps of Dascylium, to whose line he belonged. After Eupator's death, the king's corpse was beaten and his face disfigured. This profanation, however, was kept silent, so as not to damage the reputation of Pharnaces, who succeeded his father as king and was declared a 'Friend of the Roman People' by Pompey. Pharnaces took measures that recalled the old Persian tradition: he decreed the emasculation of the boys of Amisus; he used scythed chariots which had been discarded by Mithridates during his last war with Rome; he bore the title "Great King of Kings", which was the Greek way of defining the Achaemenid royalty in the Late Hellenistic period. While Eupator was probably buried in Sinope (by Pompey), Pharnaces may have chosen the old necropolis of Amasia for himself. Thus, after his reconquering of Pontus in 48 BC, he ordered the building of a new monument, which, however, was left unfinished after his defeat at Zela in 47 BC.

Queen Dynamis, the Mithradatic Lineage and Rome

Altay Coşkun

(University of Waterloo, Ontario)

Queen Dynamis is the most prominent of all Bosphoran queens. As a daughter of King Pharnakes II (63-47 BC), and thus granddaughter of Mithradates IV Eupator, she was first married to King Asandros, then King Scribonius and finally King Polemon; for some time, she even ruled in her own right, while it is controversial whether there was a period of coregency with Aspourgos, who is attested as sole king from AD 14 to 37/38. The many open questions are not confined to a precise chronology of her queenship; it is also controversial whether she was, as the offspring of the archenemy of the Romans, a defender against Roman imperialism or rather a willing friend and ally of the Romans.

While previous reconstructions of Asandros' kingship tended to put too much weight on assumed political affiliations of his wife Dynamis or were lax in applying ancient year counts, I suggest to leave all of this aside and determine the beginning of his rule through the dispersed literary sources. They seem to suggest unanimously that he revolted against Pharnakes after the battle of Nikopolis in early fall 48 BC and before the battle at Zela in late spring 47 BC. Accordingly, the series of his dated coinage ranges from 48/47 BC (Year 1) to 19/18 BC (Year 29). The latter provides a *terminus a quo* for his death – at the age of 93, if we can trust Lukian (*Makr.* 17) –, and also a *terminus ad quem* for the beginning of his co-regency with his wife Dynamis late in his life (Cass. Dio 54.24.4).

If we accept the two unique gold stateres of Queen Dynamis as authentic, the one with the era date 277 falls into 21/20 BC and may well have marked her acclamation as (co-ruling) *basilissa*. This date seems to be further corroborated by Lukian, who stresses Asandros' outstanding health at the age of 90, thus in 22/21 BC. As a result, the revolt of Scribonius and the subsequent betrayal of Asandros by Dynamis occurred in 19/18 BC. Scribonius held out as king until ca. 16 BC, when he was killed to appease the Romans.

And yet their newly chosen candidate Polemon was not admitted either. It emerges that Dynamis was the leading force against Scribonius and Polemon, hoping that she might rule in her own right, as legitimized through her blood line, loved by her people and respected by the Romans. So perhaps the more recent of her gold staters (issued in Year 281 = 17/16 BC) marked her first sole rule (unless it was simply issued to celebrate her fifth year as queen). Agrippa, however, forced her to receive Polemon as king and husband in 14 BC.

The reconstruction of the next phase of her life has recently been dominated by interpretations of the south frieze of the Ara Pacis in Rome. If Dynamis is indeed represented there together with her son (Aspourgos?) in a Roman procession of 13 BC, Agrippa might have taken them to Rome in 14 BC; many scholars now believe that they stayed until the death of Polemon, to return to rule the Bosphoros as of 8 BC. I shall argue, however, that this interpretation involves too much special pleading, and should be abandoned. Dynamis likely stayed in the Bosphoros as queen and outlived Polemon.

While the final phase of her life remains opaque (some scholars suggest to extend her rule, with some interruptions, up to AD 13/14), we have at least gained a clear picture of the overall nature of her queenship: she must have been self-confident and agile, aware of the legitimacy that her Mithradatic bloodline conveyed, but also able to gain and maintain the popularity of her ethnically mixed subjects throughout various crises. The respect she enjoyed among the leading Romans was nothing to hide, but, on the contrary, further recommended her to her own subjects, since peace with Rome promised political stability and economic prosperity. Whoever ruled the Bosphoros between 8 BC and AD 14, whether it was Dynamis, Aspourgos or others, they are likely to have played the political game along the same lines as *amici populi Romani*, *philhellenes* and respectful guardians of the Iranian heritage of their people.

Agriculture and Climate Change in Late Roman Pontus

Hugh Elton

(Trent University, Peterborough ON)

In the past decade there has been great interest in historic climate change in Anatolia, in particular the relationship between climate, changing agricultural patterns, and the collapse of the Roman Empire in the seventh century. This paper looks at these developments as they affected the area of Pontus in late antiquity. It focuses on two topics within this large field of study. The first is the relationship between climate and agriculture, looking in particular at olives, vines, and cereal crops. The second is regional variation, in that generalisations regarding Anatolia or the Eastern Mediterranean as a whole are often hard to apply to individual regions or even within individual regions. Investigation involves a combination of differing types of evidence, traditional textual and archaeological sources needing to be interpreted against data regarding climate change, particularly pollen cores. Although all of these datasets have their own complexities, it is possible to use GIS and relate the various datasets to each other. His way, we can draw meaningful conclusions regarding the changing agricultural opportunities open to the inhabitants of late Roman Pontus and the Black Sea littoral.

Der Φᾶσις zwischen Mythos, Geographie und Politik

Tassilo Schmitt
(University of Bremen)

Jüngst hat Anca Dan (*The rivers called Phasis*, *AWE* 15, 2016, 245-277) noch einmal deutlich gemacht, dass es in der Antike neben der weit verbreiteten Identifikation des Phasis mit dem heute Rioni genannten Zufluss des Schwarzen Meeres viele weitere Auffassungen darüber gab, wo dieser Strom zu suchen sei. Wie die Autorin mit Recht festhält, hängen die Lokalisierungen mit unterschiedlich gutem Wissen zusammen. Methodisch problematisch ist es aber, die konkreten Ansätze vor allem mit mehr oder weniger defizitären Kenntnissen zu erklären. Vielmehr muss danach gefragt werden, wie die jeweils zugänglichen Informationen im Kontext beurteilt, nicht zuletzt wie sie in allgemeinere Vorstellungen eingebettet waren. Einige exemplarische Erwägungen sollen zeigen, dass und wie neben der Empirie der Mythos, grundlegende geographische Überzeugungen und Entwicklungen und sogar politische Interessen die unterschiedlichen Ansätze beeinflusst haben.

Ancient Population Studies within the Framework of Social Network Analysis. A Case Study

Annamária-Izabella Pázsint
(Babeş-Bolyai University of Cluj)

Over recent decades, research on ancient population has developed considerably, giving way to new methods of research and exploration of the ancient world. Such input has often come from other fields of expertise. The proposed presentation has as its goal to underline and examine the benefits of applying the principles and methodology of the Social Network Analysis to the study of ancient populations.

The presentation will have two parts: a) the first part will have a more theoretical approach and will briefly explain the emergence and the core of a methodology which originated in the field of sociology and economics, but started to be used in ancient history and archaeology as well; b) the second part will consist of a case study, showing how Social Network Analysis can be applied successfully to the field of Ancient History. The focus will be on the private associations coming from the Greek colonies of the Black Sea area (3rd century BC – 3rd century AD). Of particular interest will be the networks created both on the inside of these associations, as well as on the outside. These networks will illustrate the linkage between members and their proximal or distant *entourage*, linkage which otherwise would not be so manifest.